GREEN ADVERTISING: TRIPLE BOTTOM LINE IN INDONESIA’S GREEN PRODUCT ADVERTISEMENT

Yuliana Rakhmawati¹, Prasetyono²

¹ Communication Department, Trunojoyo University, Indonesia
² Accounting Department, Trunojoyo University, Indonesia

yuliana.rakhmawati@yahoo.com¹, prasetyono720@gmail.com²

Abstract
Green advertising was referred to a specific type of advertising that was centered on the promotion of factors having to do with the environment. Oftentimes the companies that used green advertising also used very environmentally friendly operations and product packaging as well. Outlook Indonesian advertising industries in 2016 showed that the most influential advertising media / product info in buying a product or service is 67% through browsing and online ad clicks, 23% (advertisement in conventional media, and 10% (advertisement on short message service/ SMS). In today’s marketplace, green advertising is mandatory because nowadays consumers are listening to, and remembering, the “green” claims that advertisers are making, and a misstep in this area could have severe consequences for the bottom line. ECA was conducted to this research to examine the contribution of The Body Shop (TBS) and Pavettia Skin Care advertisements on build Indonesia’a green advertising. The result of the research showed that the two of advertisement subjects had used triple bottom line principles in distributing of advertisement message. Among other are obligation for making profit, good relationship to people and making sustainable environment (planet) in these industries.

Keywords : Green Advertising, Triple Bottom Line, Consumers, Environment

Background
The development of the latest marketing strategy using digital marketing has an effect on consumption patterns. In traditional market techniques, sellers and buyers meet by exchanging goods and services. Meanwhile, in digital market messages’ dominate to drive consumers in making selection and decision of product or service¹. This trend is a consequence of the induction sentiment form given by marketing with a green consumerism approach. The development of social construction in public spaces of the green marketers occurs consistently and continuously.

Construction of green credentials becomes one of the brand attributes that are key to market positioning aside of price, quality and reliability. Consumers who understand literacy media become a challenge in the spread of green product messages². The messages displayed by corporations in the perspective of modern marketing not only inform the public about the product but also the information that is in accordance with the rules of public rights as

¹ (Segev, Fernandes, & Wang, 2015) from the research, it is mentioned that in the context of free market, human beings have goods not merely because of the function factor or social interest but because the goods represent socially constructed sentiments through advertising.
² Advertising messages in the form of wishy-washy promises and over-stated claims will not be able to reach consumers with a good product preference.
consumer audiences. In the concept of business ethics, this inherent responsibility is referred to as the triple bottom line\(^3\).

Indonesia becomes a potential market in green product marketing. The shifting of society from land habits to labor habits did not empirically occur to be absolute. The trend in consumption of products and services began to shift back to the concept of “back to nature”. Advertising as part of marketing communication plays an important role in introducing and branding the products or services, framing messages that are attached by a variety of products and services\(^4\). With the entry of various trade ratification agreements almost all products and services can be exchanged. Various products in a market mechanism develop the brand by considering segmentation, targeting and positioning in determining price, product, placing, and promotion.

The theme of green advertising in Indonesia is also carried by manufacturers in the field of cosmetics. The other side of Asian women who are close to nature is used to evoke the brand of green\(^5\) product. In this study, there are two green cosmetics producers to be analyzed: The Body Shop represents the international brand that concerns in environmental issues and Pavettia Skin Care as a representation of local green cosmetics brand in Indonesia.

**Method**

(Krippendorf, 2004) mentions that essentially, all the reading text\(-\)haye qualitative paradigm, although on the form of certain texts narration is converted in the form of numbers. Ethnographic Content Analysis (ECA)\(^6\) approach to document analysis is offered to this research. It is proposed on narrative data and it collected by using “theoretical saturation”\(\text{e.g.:} \) The Body Shop (TBS) and Pavettia Skin Care. By rigorous examination to that corpus, ECA illustrated comparison themes held on those advertisements. The findings from the analysis are then discussed with the propositions of the triple bottom line concept, green advertising, and green marketing.

**Finding and Discussion**

**Green Marketing: Making Sense of Green Values**

The tag promoted by global green brand "The Body Shop" is “Beauty Inspired by Nature. Never Tested on Animals”, while local green products in pavettia\(\text{skincare}.\)\(\text{com}\) site carry the tag from Farm to Beauty. In the signing made by the two entities producers of green product, the message that is close to nature becomes the central theme. The results of the analysis illustrate that strong sustainability performance and inspirational communication are

\(^3\) (Elkington, 1997) to run its business, corporations not only contribute profits (profited) but also actively engage in the fulfillment of people's welfare (people) and sustainability (planet).

\(^4\) (Kim & Kim, 2014) found that there is a significant correlation between message framing on the decision to stay in hotel services industry.

\(^5\) According to (Kilbourne, 1995) the term green is characterized here as a two dimensional concept with political (reformism to radicalism) and human positional (anthropocentric to ecocentric) dimensions.

\(^6\) (Weber, 1990) writes that content analysis is a research method used to create a procedure device in making valid inferences from a text. Meanwhile, according to (Altheide, 1987) Ethnographic content analysis (ECA) refers to an integrated method, procedure, and technique for locating, identifying, retrieving, and analyzing documents for their relevance, significance, and meaning. The emphasis is on discovery and description of contexts, underlying the meaning and emergent themes.
combined to get the brand color of green and dynamic. Here are the findings of themes in the two webs using the words analysis unit:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Web</th>
<th>Featured and Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Body Shop</td>
<td>About Us: What is your commitment,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>against animal testing, building</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>biobridges, and communitytrade.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product: Every single product comes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>with ingredients and how to use it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Price: Affordable for that usefulness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CMC: Leave message</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pavettia Skin Care</td>
<td>About Us: Our story, our farm,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>our founders, press</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Product: Every single product comes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>with ingredients and how to use it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Price: Affordable for that usefulness.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CMC: Contact us</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig.1 Emerged themes in TBS and Pavettia Skin Care websites.

Corporations take green values in green advertising concept as part of marketing strategy. Messages are built and framed using the rules of production and message design. (Chang, Zhang, & Xie, 2015) writes that framing development of messages receives contributions from construal levels among consumers and the role of consumer environmental concerns. Researches related to green advertising have been done with a special methodology for a certain period of time. (Leonidou, 2011) in his research paper offers methods to analyze messages in green advertising in view of advertiser profile presence, targeting features, message aspects, copy characteristics, and situation points in advertisement messages. The green product theme brought by The Body Shop and Pavettia Skin Care also brings environmental messages not only in the composition of the product, but also in packaging and wrapping. Package concept that is close to environment is with the slogan recycling paper.7

Concepts such as recyclable, environmentally friendly, ozone safe, biodegradable become the dynamics in the study of green advertising on consumers. Some consumers are very sensitive to the themes but others see that the tags brought by green advertising are purely marketing strategies. (D’Souza, 2005) in his study of the differences of consumer groups in the involvement of green advertising themes finds polarization of perceptions are accepted because of high involvement with dimensions in green advertising, whereas in consumers with low-priced customers appear to have stronger disregard for green advertising.

Challenges to corporations by bringing green advertising in the distribution of green messages as well as other types of advertising include: competitors' advertising, limitations of budget, how to accelerate mass markets, challenge for making ads for brands or ads for products, resistance to change consumers, ads that work or ads that win awards? The mechanisms in the creation of theme units to illustrate the product's proximity to nature seem to be the right choice for now. The features provided on the TBS and Pavettia skincare websites

7 (Davis, 1995) came to the conclusion in his research that framing of environmental communication influences attitudes and environmentally responsible behaviors. Communications were framed in terms of the definition of the problem (gains and losses), the target (current and future generations), and recommended activities ("taking less," as in conservation, or "doing more," as in recycling).
refer to the verbal touch and "green" visualization with the dominant composition on soft and nude color selection.

**Green Advertising and Green Consumer**

Consumers using the average green products have their own preference for the green concept. (Greenwald & Leavitt, 1984) writes that the tendency of green consumer in the decision of choosing green products is not merely due to media advertising but because of their good perception involvement of brand value. From the analysis of the messages on the TBS and Pavettia Skin Care sites, there was sufficient information about the contributions that these two labels made to nature conservation issues and support for consumer rights.

On some web display links, carrying campaign messages like against animal testing, stop sex trafficking, global shea alliance.

The web does not show affiliation on a particular campaign. But there is a visualization about their farm, their founder, and the objective to bring the best of nature which radiates the beauty.

![Fig. 2. Display and visual "nature" on TBS and Pavettiaskin care](image)

Changing the concept of brand performance in a positive audience perception is not an easy thing. Touchstone to show the separation that in business there are rights and obligations that are attached by ethical conduct to the corporation. According to (Zinkhan & Carlson., 2013) in the context of United States consumers in the era of the 80s, there are reluctant consumers who reject the green messages in advertising. But in its development into the 20th and 21st centuries the trend is changing, the consumption of media messages is dominated by messages that carry the green theme. Since 1995, green advertising has got a place in academic studies in marketing communications and advertising domains. The new media era is increasingly making widespread interest in green marketing communication studies where one of them is the practice of green advertising with a unique framework pattern⁸.

According to Greenwald (1984: 585) consumer involvement to brand advertising occurs in four levels: pre-attention, focal attention, comprehension, elaboration. In this decade, consumer's tendency to engage in environmental issues is getting higher. (Kareklas, Carlson, & Muehling, 2013, pp. 25-39) expressions in the form of consumer attitudes and behavior toward the future survival of the planet became prominent. This pattern of perception makes green

---

⁸See (Sheehan & Atkinson, 2012) for further posts.
products - increasingly desirable because it can provide customer satisfaction from the side of the message approaching nature.

**Triple Bottom Line Awareness or Green Capitalism**

In the framework of trade, the presence of green advertising is placed as a form of innovation from a marketing communication. The production of messages that are carried out by the principle of cognitive theories⁹ in the creation of trends will be the themes of "approaching" nature. Corporations have a responsibility to all stakeholders including owners, consumers, distributors, employees, financial institutions, regulators and audiences in general. The company has a responsibility in promoting the principles of business ethics.

As an innovation in marketing, green advertising can ignite further discussions about its contribution not only in the distribution of green messages, but also in public education about good advertising. The pattern of approach done by audiences is always in the quadrant of myth and mechanism. Ads are silent symbols assigned to move the mind of the audience to fulfill the mechanism of submission. The creative process in subordinating the audience to the "buy-ology of mind" mechanism (Sutherland, 2008, p. 301).

The dynamic that attracts green advertising as a corporate responsibility mechanism with triple bottom line principles but on the other hand ignites dialogue about the presence of green capitalism. Smith (2011) in (Smith, 2015) argued that green technology, green taxes, green labeling, eco-conscious shopping and the like could "align" profit-seeking with environmental goals, even "invent many fundamentals" of business practice such as "restoring the environment and making money become one and the same process".

In the mechanism of message rotation in green advertising, the presence of themes of nature and environment are very dominant. These concepts are in line with the principle of green capitalism¹⁰ that wants all resources to be managed for the fulfillment of welfare under government regulatory instruments and as much as possible to solve environmental problems.

The creative process of creating messages in green advertising is a milestone in managing the potential of nature to be juxtaposed with consumer needs and in line with government regulation and business ethics. Green advertising as one form of corporate responsibility in giving rights to stakeholders can be supported by green capitalism to direct the utilization, especially natural and human resources for sustainability and life in the future.

**Conclusion**

Green advertising as a means of message distribution provides a new sentiment in the perception formations of products or services. The development of themes on global warming, deforestation, pollutant emissions, climate change and other environments becomes an enabling condition for the growth of alternative themes in consumer preferences for redefinition with nature. Public consumption patterns of food products (food and beverages), medicines, and cosmetics also began to shift in contact with nature as natural and natural resources as its production process.

Over the course of the theme of capitalism becomes dominant in discussing contributions in business and marketing. With the start of green advertising, it is expected that

---

⁹Cognitive theories in the rules of messaging (message production) takes place in three main premises: message planning, message designing and goal complaining. See (Littlejohn, 1999) in the Message Production chapter.

¹⁰Often called eco-capitalism or environmental capitalism.
there will be a mechanism of penance for former capitalism form with green capitalism that is more aware to the principles of business ethics. The value of triple bottom line in the development of industry based on the development of natural and human resources that will positively fight in free and fair trade mechanism.

Reference


http://icmc.stikosa-aws.ac.id

